

Issues Report Card

Good Governance

Cultural Heritage

Developing capacities for good urban governance

THE URBAN GOVERNANCE INITIATIVE (TUGI)

Working towards cities that are **Socially Just, Ecologically Sustainable, Politically Participatory, Economically Productive and Culturally Vibrant**

Why good governance?

The pace of economic growth in the Asia Pacific region over the past two decades has resulted in rapid urbanisation. By the year 2010, Asia is expected to produce 45% of the world's GDP growth and be home to 4.2 billion of the world's 7 billion people, 43% of whom will reside in cities.

But despite impressive GDP growth, these economic gains have not benefited everyone. Real incomes of most workers in many countries have fallen substantially, disparities between rich and poor have increased and almost a third of the population in developing countries - some 1.3 billion people - still live in poverty.

Because the region's rapid economic growth has largely taken place in urban centres, the capacity of a nation to pursue its economic goals becomes contingent on its ability to govern its cities. Urban governance has, therefore, assumed increasing importance as a means to ensure that economic growth is equitable, sustainable and improves the human condition. In this context, good governance has become central to sustainable human development.

What is sustainable human development?

UNDP defines human development as "a process of enlarging the choices for all people in society". Sustainable human development "places people at the centre of the development process and makes the central purpose of development as creating an enabling environment in which all people can enjoy a long, healthy and creative life".¹

It is pro-people, pro-jobs and pro-nature, and gives the highest priority to poverty reduction, productive employment, social integration, and environmental regeneration. Sustainable human development should be able to meet the needs of this present generation without compromising the needs of future generations. It seeks to ensure that everyone, particularly the poor and vulnerable, benefits from economic growth through promoting:

- **empowerment** - by expanding people's capabilities and choices
- **co-operation** - by encouraging better ways in which individuals cooperate and interact
- **equity** - in terms of income, capabilities and opportunities
- **sustainability** - by meeting the needs of the present generation without compromising the ability of future generations to be free from poverty and deprivation
- **security** - particularly security of livelihood, where citizens are free from threats such as disease, repression or sudden harmful dislocations in their daily lives

In order to ensure that economic growth is a means to these ends, the UN has focussed on four critical elements of sustainable human development.² To achieve sustainable development, good governance must take into account:

- **eliminating poverty**
- **creating jobs and sustaining livelihoods**
- **protecting and regenerating the environment**
- **advancing women**

What is good governance?

Governance can be seen as the exercise of economic, political and administrative authority to manage a country's affairs at all levels. It comprises the mechanisms, processes and institutions through which citizens and groups articulate their interests, exercise their legal rights, meet their obligations and mediate their differences.

¹ *Human Development Report, UNDP 1994*

² *Governance For Sustainable Human Development, UNDP 1997*

Good governance is, among other things, participatory, transparent and accountable. It is also effective and equitable, and promotes the rule of law fairly. Good governance ensures that the voices of the poorest and the most vulnerable are heard in decision-making over the allocation of development resources, and that political, social and economic priorities are based on broad consensus among the three stakeholders - the state, private sector and civil society.³

All three stakeholders are critical for sustaining human development: the state creates a conducive political and legal environment; the private sector generates jobs and income; and civil society facilitates political and social interaction. With the advent of globalisation and the integration of economies, the state's task is also to find a balance between taking advantage of emerging market opportunities and providing a secure and stable social and economic environment domestically.

In its book *Governance For Sustainable Human Development*,* UNDP identifies nine core characteristics covering eight key urban issues which measure good governance.

Core characteristics of good governance

1) Participation - All men and women should have a voice in decision-making, either directly or through legitimate intermediate institutions that represent their interests. Such broad participation is built on freedom of association and speech, as well as capacities to participate constructively

2) Rule of law - Legal frameworks should be fair and enforced impartially, particularly the laws on human rights

3) Transparency - Transparency is built on the free flow of information. Processes, institutions and information are directly accessible to those concerned with them, and enough information is provided to understand and monitor them

4) Responsiveness - Institutions and processes try to serve all stakeholders

5) Consensus orientation - Good governance mediates differing interests to reach a broad consensus on what is in the best interest of the group and, where possible, on policies and procedures

6) Equity - All men and women have opportunities to improve or maintain their well-being

7) Effectiveness and efficiency - Processes and institutions produce results that meet needs while making the best use of resources

8) Accountability - Decision-makers in government, the private sector and civil society organisations are accountable to the public, as well as to institutional stakeholders. This accountability differs depending on the organisation and whether the decision is internal or external to an organisation

9) Strategic vision - Leaders and the public have a broad and long-term perspective on good governance and human development, along with a sense of what is needed for such development. There is also an understanding of the historical, cultural and social complexities in which that perspective is grounded

Key urban issues in good governance

The 1997 UNDP Mayor's survey identified and ranked eight most important quality of life issues. These key urban issues cannot be addressed without good governance.

- 1) Employment/job creation**
- 2) Solid waste collection and disposal**
- 3) Urban poverty**
- 4) Shelter and housing**
- 5) Water and sanitation**
- 6) Public transport and traffic**
- 7) Health services**
- 8) Civil society participation**

³ *Governance For Sustainable Human Development, UNDP 1997*

The Good Governance Report Card - User's Guide

Getting involved

The Good Governance Report Card is one way for you to participate in and improve the governance of your city. Good governance, amongst other things, contributes to sustainable human development. Empowerment and participation are also key elements in good governance and sustainable human development.

Who can and should use it?

The Report Card is aimed at:

- local authorities, specifically mayors, governors and city administrators
- regional associations of cities or municipalities and relevant training and research institutes
- relevant members of civil society
- relevant institutions of the central government and the private sector
- international development agencies

What can I achieve?

Evaluate: The Good Governance Report Card is a simple and flexible tool which will enable you to measure the:

- performance of the political and administrative regimes of the city, problems that stress them, and the effectiveness of their responses
- direction of the local urban governance
- impact of such governance in the short run
- degree of democratic participation in local governance

Understand: The Report Card is aimed at encouraging and assisting urban local government institutions and their civil society and corporate sector partners in understanding and appreciating the need for:

- good governance
- regular assessment of their performance to determine and address the strengths and weaknesses of the city's political and administrative mechanisms
- good methodologies and indicators for self-assessment

Promote: By coming up with solutions and actions which involve all three stakeholders - state, private business and civil society - the Report Card can encourage greater participation, responsiveness and accountability, which is itself conducive to a healthier city. Good governance promotes:

- a novel urban partnership culture that respects the needs and responsibility of each other to keep an adequate cooperative tab on the processes of city planning, administration and governance
- a readily available and regularly updated, comprehensive database to measure the status and trends of the city's governance and its impact
- a constantly improving city governance which is responsive, responsible and accountable

How to use the Good Governance Report Card

1) Identify the major interest groups concerned about city governance (e.g. elected municipal councillors, senior municipal officials, NGOs, civil society groups, private businesses, religious organisations).

2) Select a representative sample of respondents from these groups to administer the Report Card.

3) Select four indicators relevant to your city's condition and needs. To select indicators of good governance:

- Refer to the suggested list of indicators at the bottom of each page and choose those relevant to your city's context
- You may wish to identify and evaluate other indicators which you can add or replace the recommended list with. You can also work out new indicators in consultation with all participating stakeholders in a workshop situation
- Grade the performance of your city council by awarding points (1 point for "very poor" to 5 points for "very good"). As in the selection of indicators, grading can be done by a simple survey or in consultation (e.g. through a workshop process)
- Work out the percentage score from each respondent (total points per respondent divided by maximum score possible [20], multiplied by 100) for each core characteristic (e.g. participation, equity, transparency, accountability, etc)
- Work out the total score and percentage of your city administration's overall performance in good governance by adding up the score for each core characteristic.
- Assess the effectiveness of your local government system and processes based on the following scale:

85%-100%	Very good. (Keep it up)
65%-84%	Good. (But still room to improve)
50%-64%	Fair. (Can do much better)
35%-49%	Poor. (More commitment and effort needed)
Below 35%	Very poor. (Something is drastically wrong)

Note: You may wish to choose your own comments for each score.

What can you do after evaluation?

Here are some of the things that can be done on a city and national level after completing the Report Card:

- Initiate a self evaluation by all stakeholders - city council and relevant government departments, private businesses and civil society groups
- Form discussion groups within each stakeholder group
- Forge partnerships between all three stakeholders to formulate ideas and a joint plan of action
- Publicise the results of the Report Card and any follow-up action through news releases, press conferences and media interviews to create public awareness and encourage wider participation
- Share your results with other city councils to encourage good governance

The Good Governance Issues Report Card:
Cultural Heritage

Core characteristic of good governance #1: Participation

Indicators to measure the level of participation (See suggestions below or identify your own. Please list four indicators.)	Grade (1-5)
1)	
2)	
3)	
4)	
Total	
Percentage [total ÷ 20 x 100]	
<p>Some examples of indicators on participation could be:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Existing policies and programmes of the local government to encourage participation of the private sector and the civil societies for the conservation and promotion of cultural heritage. Situation of the local government and the civil society/private sector partnership programmes for the conservation of cultural heritage in the city. Extent of civil society involvement in the maintenance and conservation of monuments and sites of cultural importance. Extent of private sector involvement in the maintenance and conservation of monuments and sites of cultural importance. Extent of community mobilisation for the conservation of the cultural heritage. 	<p>Grades</p> <p>5: Very Good 4: Good 3: Moderate 2: Poor 1: Very Poor</p>

The Good Governance Issues Report Card:
Cultural Heritage

Core characteristic of good governance #3: Transparency

Indicators to measure the level of transparency (See suggestions below or identify your own. Please list four indicators.)	Grade (1-5)
1)	
2)	
3)	
4)	
Total	
Percentage [total ÷ 20 x 100]	
<p>Some examples of indicators on transparency could be:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Transparency on the municipal revenue and expenditures from monuments and sites of cultural importance. • Transparency on municipal spending on the repair, maintenance and conservation of monuments and sites of cultural importance. • Access to information and processes related to maintenance and conservation of cultural heritage for city dwellers. • Transparency on staff recruitment, awarding contracts and budget allocation. • Frequency of communication and information sharing with the residents. 	<p>Grades</p> <p>5: Very Good 4: Good 3: Moderate 2: Poor 1: Very Poor</p>

The Good Governance Issues Report Card:
Cultural Heritage

Core characteristic of good governance #4: Responsiveness

Indicators to measure the level of responsiveness (See suggestions below or identify your own. Please list four indicators.)	Grade (1-5)
1)	
2)	
3)	
4)	
Total	
Percentage [total ÷ 20 x 100]	
<p>Some examples of indicators on responsiveness could be:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mechanism to ascertain the need and aspirations of the stakeholders of the city on cultural heritage. • Mechanisms to listen address and act on public grievances and views. • Coverage of the monuments and sites (actions) of cultural importance by city administration. • Preparation of inventory and classification of the monuments and sites according to their importance. • Priority given to the task of heritage conservation. 	<p>Grades</p> <p>5: Very Good 4: Good 3: Moderate 2: Poor 1: Very Poor</p>

The Good Governance Issues Report Card:
Cultural Heritage

Core characteristic of good governance #5: Consensus Orientation

Indicators to measure the level of consensus orientation (See suggestions below or identify your own. Please list four indicators.)	Grade (1-5)
1)	
2)	
3)	
4)	
Total	
Percentage [total ÷ 20 x 100]	
<p>Some examples of indicators on consensus orientation could be:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Practice of all political party consensus on major, important and strategic decisions related to heritage conservation. • Institutional mechanism to consult civil societies and private sector. • Institutional mechanism to consult individuals and institutions directly affected. • Use of mass media for public awareness, support and consensus building. • Frequency of consultation with different stakeholders. 	<p>Grades</p> <p>5: Very Good 4: Good 3: Moderate 2: Poor 1: Very Poor</p>

The Good Governance Issues Report Card:
Cultural Heritage

Core characteristic of good governance #6: Equity

Indicators to measure the level of equity (See suggestions below or identify your own. Please list four indicators.)	Grade (1-5)
1)	
2)	
3)	
4)	
Total	
Percentage [total ÷ 20 x 100]	
<p>Some examples of indicators on equity could be:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Coverage of the monuments and sites in totality. • Concern shown by NGOs, CBOs, communities and private sector for heritage conservation. • Extent of gender sensitiveness in addressing the issue of heritage conservation. • Level of support provided to individuals. • Level of support provided to institutions. 	<p>Grades</p> <p>5: Very Good 4: Good 3: Moderate 2: Poor 1: Very Poor</p>

The Good Governance Issues Report Card:
Cultural Heritage

**Core characteristic of good governance #7:
Effectiveness & Efficiency**

Indicators to measure the level of effectiveness & efficiency (See suggestions below or identify your own. Please list four indicators.)	Grade (1-5)
1)	
2)	
3)	
4)	
Total	
Percentage [total ÷ 20 x 100]	
<p>Some examples of indicators on effectiveness & efficiency could be:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Proper utilisation of the scarce municipal resources for heritage conservation activities. (Cost effectiveness with no compromise on quality) • Collection of taxes, revenues and service charges from monuments and sites of cultural importance. • Over all level of care for monuments and sites of cultural importance. • Mobilisation of internal resources from private sector, civil societies and individuals. • Mobilisation of external resources from institutions, individuals and tourists. 	<p>Grades</p> <p>5: Very Good 4: Good 3: Moderate 2: Poor 1: Very Poor</p>

The Good Governance Issues Report Card:
Cultural Heritage

Core characteristic of good governance #8: Accountability

Indicators to measure the level of accountability (See suggestions below or identify your own. Please list four indicators.)	Grade (1-5)
1)	
2)	
3)	
4)	
Total	
Percentage [total ÷ 20 x 100]	
<p>Some examples of indicators on accountability could be:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To what extent the municipal staff and councillors realise they are accountable for the consequences of what they do and don't do? • To what extent the grievances and complains are entertained by the municipal authority. • Legal provisions for compensation for damage of private and public property due to third party negligence. • The level of awareness of the councillors and municipal staff on heritage conservation. • The level of awareness among the citizens on importance of the cultural heritage. 	<p>Grades</p> <p>5: Very Good 4: Good 3: Moderate 2: Poor 1: Very Poor</p>

The Good Governance Issues Report Card:
Cultural Heritage

Core characteristic of good governance #9: Strategic Vision

Indicators to measure the level of strategic vision (See suggestions below or identify your own. Please list four indicators.)	Grade (1-5)
1)	
2)	
3)	
4)	
Total	
Percentage [total ÷ 20 x 100]	
<p>Some examples of indicators on strategic vision could be:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Availability of long term programme and policy on heritage conservation. • Annuals plan and programmes on heritage conservation. • Longer-term vision of any other organisations involved in heritage conservation. • Level of visionary among municipal staff and councillors on heritage conservation. • Level of visionary among NGOs, CBOs, communities and private sector on heritage conservation. 	<p>Grades</p> <p>5: Very Good 4: Good 3: Moderate 2: Poor 1: Very Poor</p>

The Good Governance General Report Card
Cultural Heritage
Overall grade for good governance

Characteristics of good governance	Grade (1-5)	Percentage
1) Participation		
2) Rule of law		
3) Transparency		
4) Responsiveness		
5) Consensus orientation		
6) Equity		
7) Effectiveness and efficiency		
8) Accountability		
9) Strategic vision		
Total (Percentage = total ÷ 180 x 100)		

What is the Good Governance Report Card?

The Good Governance Report Card is an evaluation tool introduced by TUGI and designed for you to assess the level of good governance in your city. The Report Card hopes to promote sustainable human development through better governance of urban centres.

The Report Card employs nine core characteristics of good governance to evaluate how healthy your city is and comes in a series - you can use the General Report Card to evaluate the overall governance of your city, or the Issues Report Card to evaluate any of the following eight key urban issues:

- 1) Employment/job creation
- 2) Solid waste collection and disposal
- 3) Urban poverty
- 4) Shelter and housing
- 5) Water and sanitation
- 6) Public transport and traffic
- 7) Health services
- 8) Civil society participation

If you have any additional important issues directly pertaining to your city and wish to incorporate these in the Good Governance Report Card, you can get in touch with TUGI for assistance. You can also contact us for examples of Issues Report Cards from other cities.

Who is TUGI?

The Urban Governance Initiative (TUGI) is a United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) project to help local governments make cities in the Asia Pacific more liveable, particularly for the urban poor, women and children, by promoting good governance principles based on:

- social justice
- ecological sustainability
- political participation
- economic productivity
- cultural vibrancy

Specifically, TUGI seeks to:

- improve the quality of urban life by developing indicators, tools and methodologies for good governance, identifying positive references that can be developed, and enhancing the capacities of local authorities
- develop mechanisms to share and enhance the quality of information on urban governance for sustainable human development and to improve the quality of life of people throughout the region
- assist mayors and city governments to take full advantage of the increasing flow of information and networking mechanisms

Presently, TUGI's current awareness service comes in the form of Urban Links, a quarterly newsletter.

For further information contact:

The Urban Governance Initiative (TUGI)

United Nations Development Programme (UNDP)
Wisma UN, Kompleks Pejabat Damansara (Block C)
Jalan Dungun, Damansara Heights
50490 Kuala Lumpur
Malaysia

Tel: (603) 2095 9122 · Fax (603) 2093 2361

E-mail: tugi@undp.org; Website: <http://www.tugi.apdip.net> or www.tugi.org.